

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

1) **Call to Order:**

Vice-Chair Araujo called the meeting to order at 5:20 p.m.

2) **Roll Call**

Members Present: Karen Araujo, Raul Calvo, Tyler Williamson

Wes White Joined Meeting at 5:18 p.m.

Members Absent: Ignacio “Mog” Cabatu and Virginia Mendoza

Staff Present: Melanie Beretti, Carl Holm, Mary Israel, Darby Marshall, Anita Nachor, Wendy Strimling, Anastacia Wyatt

Others Present: Larry Bacon, Emily Ham, Rafael Hernandez, Margie Kay, Esther Malkin, Jim Moose, Margaret Robbins, Eric Sand, Asaf Shalev, Pris Walton, Michael Waxer, Alan Williams, Jeff Wood,

3) **Public Comment:**

The Housing Advisory Committee will receive public comment on items not listed on the agenda within the purview of the Housing Advisory Committee. The Chair may limit the length of individual presentations.

No Public Comment

4) **Approval of Meeting Minutes for November 4, 2020**

Action: A motion was made by Mr. Williamson to approve the November 4, 2020 minutes. Mr. Calvo seconded the motion.

VOTES:

AYES: Araujo, Calvo, White, Williamson

NAYS:

ABSENT: Cabatu, Mendoza

ABSTAINED:

5) **Old Business:**

None

6) **New Business:**

- a. Elect members of the Housing Advisory Committee to serve as a. Chair and
- b. Vice-Chair

Action: A motion was made by Mr. Williams to nominate Mr. Williamson for Chair and Karen Araujo for Vice-Chair. Mr. Calvo seconded the motion.

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

VOTES:

AYES: Araujo, Calvo, White, Williamson

NAYS:

ABSENT: Cabatu, Mendoza

ABSTAINED:

- b. Receive a report on the Rancho Canada Village Project; and Provide a recommendation on the affordable housing component of the Rancho Canada Village Project, proposed to be 20% moderate income units.
Carl Holm gave a report on the Rancho Canada Village project and a discussion was held. Receive and File.

Wendy Strimling requested Anita Nachor email out the letter from the CVA.

Anita Nachor emailed the letter from the CVA to the Committee Members

Extensive discussion regarding Rancho Canada Village Project

Jim Moose presented information on the Rancho Canada project on behalf of the applicant, Alan Williams.

Alan Williams gave an update on the Rancho Canada project.

Tyller Williamson, stated the he was not able to review the report that was sent. Suggest having another meeting to give folks time to analyze and for the Committee to be able to provide a thoughtful advisory service recommendation to the Board of Supervisors.

Public Comment:

Pris Walter, the Carmel Valley Association (CVA) stated that the CVA was not informed until yesterday about the HAC meeting, nor did they know about the HAC meeting in November, or the CVA would have submitted the letter earlier so that the Committee would have had time to read it.

The CVA believes that it is an attempt to avoid compliance with Monterey County Inclusionary Housing ordinance. Essentially, CVA believes that the reasoning and the unforeseen circumstances are not verifiable and not factual. The CVA also thinks that, when you are in the business of being in real estate, there's certain risks that you take, and the county should not be trying to define and prevent what is unforeseen and it's not unusual.

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

Emily Ham, Monterey Bay Economic Partnership (MBEP) stated that MBEP is not here to take any sort of position but wants to ask a couple of questions and make a couple of points. Would like the market analysis to be included in the Minutes of the agenda?

What was the driver behind doing the market analysis? Why was it conducted by the applicant? Ms. Ham stated that she is wary of developers that might have some sort of inclination to look for data that supports what they prefer to build based on their bottom-line numbers. It is not the best practice to have developers do these kinds of analyses and present them as a justification for minimizing the number of units to build the low and very low.

Units are needed in Carmel valley, but would also say that this is a good opportunity for the county, especially because the housing element season is coming upon us. This is a good opportunity for the County to review what is needed.

Esther Malkin/Monterey County Renters stated, which workers, besides firefighters are going to be able to qualify for the moderate units? The city of Carmel and Carmel Valley do not have jobs that would support those expensive lots, even if they are considered moderate.

Where exactly are the low-income workers workforce expected to live? Carmel has a serious traffic issue. The expectation has always been for those workers to commute. It is advisable to take an opportunity to add to the lower income housing when most of the workers happen to be low wage. Ms. Malkin stated that she believed that this is another attempt at kicking the can down the road that has gotten not just our county, but the state in the position of not having enough housing.

In general, and whenever there's an opportunity, it leads to build for the moderate and higher demographic so I urge everybody involved in this project and others that have an opportunity to house some low income workers, which in this case would more than likely be hospitality.

a

Larry Bacon, CVA stated that he contributed the letter that was sent to the county. He has a background in Finance. He worked as a Financial Officer for 25 years at Wells Fargo Bank and Chase Bank and has observed the financial projections that Alan and his group have provided. Mr. Bacon also stated that there is a difference of opinion as to what is in the best interest of the community of Carmel Valley. CVA has consistently been pushing for a

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

higher number higher percentage of affordable housing as an element on this this project, 20% will not work.

The major part of the \$16 million projected cost for the site. Seems that there should be some room for negotiation within those figures. Also, Mr. Williams pointed out that some of the 16 million is past cost. It will cost, there's not some of them are at his Risk in fault. There are other numbers to be challenged, but the numbers have not been discussed.

Mr. Williams suggested possibly using a nonprofit and tax credits to assist in structuring the affordable housing project. Possibly could take the finance burden off and allow him to lower the cost of the lot that is he is offering to the County workforce.

Erick Sand, CVA, stated that he has been deeply involved in Rancho Canada Village project for several years and has observed comings and goings. Mr. Sand also stated that he did an in-depth analysis of the 2016 EIR and at the time we discovered that the flood control aspects of Rancho Canada Village project were only for one boundary, a very intricate on a village project and the rest of the surrounding community. Would the county or the homeowners be responsible for the cost of the additional flood controls that will be needed to connect to the Rancho Canada flood control area? There are many hidden areas of costs that are being off cited to other entities, besides the Central Rancho Canada Village endeavor.

The cost of the community would be heavy in terms of traffic and it has a ripple effect on the concentration of residents in that area would greatly affect people's ability to function and to feel that they live in a rural area. The whole premise of the Carmel Valley master plan is to maintain a rural area and we are fighting very heavily very in depth and keep it that way

Alan Williams, Applicant, stated that his partner Mr. Eastwood is in the hospitality industry of Mission Ranch and Pebble Beach. His employees do not qualify for low or very low. They are predominantly moderate and above. I have been in the construction industry almost 50 years and my employees are moderate income.

Mr. Williams also stated is he is trying get 25 income housing units for his employees that work here. If able to get the housing units, it would ease traffic and take his employee off the roads. Additionally, Mr. Williams is trying to get 105 market rate units that are affordable by all standards

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

Mr. Williams stated that he is willing to talk with the CVA but cannot change numbers when he is not able to pay for it. Regarding Mr. Bacon's comment, look at the financial report, if I go to 30%, I lose \$6 million and it would be difficult to finance that amount. Mr. Williams stated that he would appreciate action tonight. Trying to do the right thing and the support of the HAC Committee would be appreciated. But if you must recommend low and very low, I understand it is ultimately a policy decision by the Board of Supervisors and he can take that argument at that level.

Tyler Williamson, HAC Committee Member stated that he would suggest having an ad hoc or a special meeting in order to give everybody a chance to review the report before making our final decision.

Karen Araujo, HAC Committee Member, stated that she would like time to read over the report. Agrees with Mr. Williams that an AD Hoc or Special meeting should be scheduled.

Raul Calvo, HAC Committee Member, stated that he agrees with Karen Araujo. In order to be fair to Mr. Alan, Mr. Calvo requested a couple of days to review the report.

Carl Holm stated that the County is working on the, response to comments for the EIR. Staff can post the letters and reports to the website for the public.

Action: A motion was made by Ms. Araujo to approve a HAC Special Meeting for February to have additional time to read the report. Mr. Calvo seconded the motion.

VOTES:

AYES: Araujo, Calvo, White, Williamson

NAYS:

ABSENT: Cabatu, Mendoza

ABSTAINED:

- c. Receive a report on the Monterey County Emergency Rent and Utility Relief Program (MCERURP)

Action: A motion was made by Mr. Williams to approve to table 6c to the next meeting. Mr. White seconded the motion.

VOTES:

AYES: Araujo, Calvo, White, Williamson

HOUSING ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

ZOOM MEETING

Wednesday, January 13, 2021 5:00 PM

NAYS:

ABSENT: Cabatu, Mendoza

ABSTAINED:

7). Committee Member Reports

Committee members will report on matters, events, and activities related to HAC goals and housing advocacy matters. Committee members may give direction regarding future agenda items.

None

8). Updates from Staff:

None

9). Schedule of Upcoming Meetings

March 10, 2021

May 12, 2021

July 14, 2021

September 8, 2021

November 10, 2021

10) Adjournment:

Action: Chair Williams moved to adjourn. The meeting was adjourned at 7:10 PM.