



HYAS GROUP

9755 SW Barnes Road, Suite 660
Portland, Oregon 97225

MAIN 971.634.1500 FAX 503.914.0022
www.hyasgroup.com

February 2024

RE: Tracking Error of the Vanguard Target Retirement Date Suite

Vanguard offers a Target Retirement Date suite (“suite”) as an investment option for use within defined contribution plans, allowing participants to invest in an asset allocation that is managed to remain age-appropriate for those intending to retire around the year embedded in the fund’s name (e.g. Vanguard Target Retirement 2030). The suite is composed of index funds from US and International Stock and Bond asset classes. While performance remains generally competitive versus peers, the suite has experienced challenges in tracking its custom benchmark for the past several years. From 2019-2023 for example, the mutual fund shares of the Income and 2020 through 2065 funds have lagged their benchmarks by an average of -0.43% per calendar year. In no instance has any fund within the suite tracked by closer than -0.14%. For the trailing three-year period ending 12/31/2023, these funds trailed their benchmarks by an annual average of -0.34% despite having investment expenses of 0.08%. Such continuous underperformance is not to be expected from an index-offering. This memo summarizes the causes of such tracking error and provides the Hyas Group’s outlook.

Performance Background:

The suite experienced a substantial amount of tracking error and execution cost during the rapid market decline and rebound at the start of the pandemic caused by Covid-19 in 2020. This experience prompted Vanguard to perform a multi-quarter risk analysis to identify ways to reduce tracking error, execution costs, market disruption, and the potential for inopportune timing. In February of 2021 and in conclusion to these analyses, Vanguard established management policies with greater latitude; including widening rebalancing thresholds relative to targets, moving to a monthly rebalancing approach, and allowing limited use of futures to gain market exposure. The Hyas Group reviewed these changes and concluded that they provided Vanguard with increased but still constrained flexibility and did not warrant investment action.

Implementation has been challenging for Vanguard however and appears to be responsible for the bulk of underperformance. For example, for the three-year period ending 9/30/2023 (the most recent attribution on hand as of this memo), the “Allocation Impact” which Vanguard describes as “Out/Underperformance due to differences in the strategic asset allocation of the funds versus their benchmarks. These differences can be particularly notable at times of significant market volatility as portfolio managers work to balance transaction costs against a daily rebalanced benchmark” had subtracted -0.12% to -0.31% of annual performance. Secondly, the “Fair Value Pricing Impact”, which is a pricing adjustment mutual funds with international exposure put in place to prevent market timing, has subtracted -0.03% to -0.07% from annual returns for this period.

While Vanguard believes that its current approach may have better long-term investment outcomes, it acknowledges the unintended consequences of the past few years and is undergoing a cross-departmental working group to refine and improve its rebalancing procedures and reduce short-term tracking error.

Outlook:

Vanguard's tracking challenges over the past few years are likely a source of substantial internal focus and furthermore appear fixable considering that prior years generally had lower tracking error and that such underperformance is uncommon among index funds or fund-of-funds. As such, the Hvas Group will be monitoring Vanguard's performance closely to evaluate if new policies emerge and lead to improved outcomes. No pertaining investment action is intended by the Hvas Group at the moment, but this topic remains a source of increased interest.

Sources: Vanguard and Morningstar.

Disclosure:

The views and opinions expressed in this commentary are those of the portfolio manager at the time of this writing and do not necessarily represent those of Hvas Group, Morgan Stanley, its affiliates or its other employees. Of course, these views may change without notice in response to changing circumstances and market conditions. Furthermore, this commentary contains forward-looking statements and there can be no guarantee that they will come to pass. Historical data shown represents past performance and does not guarantee comparable future results. The information and statistical data contained herein have been obtained from sources that are believed to be reliable but in no way are guaranteed by Hvas Group as to accuracy or completeness.

The material in this Report is not to be reproduced or distributed to any other persons (other than professional advisors of the investors) and is intended solely for the use of the persons to whom it has been delivered. This material is not for distribution to the general public.

This information is being provided as a service of your Hvas Group Consultant and does not supersede or replace your customer account statement provided by your custodian ("Custodial Statement"). Information in this Report may vary from the information in your Custodial Statement as a result of differences in accounting procedures, reporting dates, or valuation methodologies of certain securities. The market values reflected in this Report may vary slightly from the market values in your Custodial Statement. The information in this Report is as of the date(s) noted and subject to daily market fluctuation.

No Tax or Legal Advice. When Hvas Group, its affiliates and Hvas Group Consultants provide "investment advice" regarding a retirement or welfare benefit plan account, an individual retirement account or a Coverdell education savings account ("Retirement Account"), Hvas Group is a "fiduciary" as those terms are defined under the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974, as amended ("ERISA"), and/or the Internal Revenue Code of 1986 (the "Code"), as applicable. When Hvas Group provides investment education or otherwise does not provide "investment advice", Hvas Group will not be considered a "fiduciary" under ERISA and/or the Code. Tax laws are complex and subject to change. Hvas Group does not provide tax or legal advice.

Sources of Information. Material in this Report has been obtained from sources that we believe to be reliable, but we do not guarantee its accuracy, completeness, or timeliness. The performance produced herein is calculated utilizing custodian data downloads and manually entered material. Although we take every precaution to ensure accuracy, we are not able to guarantee complete accuracy.

Asset and plan activity information provided by plan recordkeeper. Vendor bids and corresponding information sourced from Request for Proposal responses. Expense information sourced from Morningstar.

This document may contain forward-looking statements within the meaning of the federal securities laws. Forward-looking statements are those that predict or describe future events or trends and that do not relate solely to historical matters. Actual results could and likely will differ, sometimes materially, from those projected or anticipated. We are not undertaking any obligation to update or revise any forward-looking statements whether as a result of new information, future events or otherwise. You should not take any statements regarding past trends as a representation those trends or activities will continue in the future. Accordingly, you should not put undue reliance on these statements.

Results of any sample client analyses, audits, case studies, or otherwise are representative only and are not necessarily indicative of all client results. Any fee savings perceived favorable results, positive outcomes or otherwise are not guaranteed to and should be expected by any prospective client.

Hvas Group is a separate business unit within Morgan Stanley Institutional Investment Advisors LLC.

©Morgan Stanley, 2024