

Circa: Historical Property Development Summary

- Residence does not meet any national, state, or local criteria for historical resources

Modernism Not Unique to 1170 Signal Hill Road

Summary of Findings by Circa

Circa Historical Resources Evaluation

Circa: Historic Property Development (Circa) conducted a comprehensive evaluation of the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road in Pebble Beach, and found that it did not meet any of Monterey County's criteria for historical resources. County staff asked Circa to consider the property not only within the context of the Second Bay Area Tradition of Modernism—a rustic aesthetic fused with the functional design of European Modernism—but also within the wider context of American International or Contemporary residential architecture—a machine-like style popularized by Southern California Modern architects.

Pebble Beach Survey

In January 2012 the Circa team mapped the entire Pebble Beach community and identified 900 homes constructed between 1944-1962. Circa then surveyed by helicopter residences most like 1170 Signal Hill Road, built in 1958. Using the subject property as a center point and surveying outward, they identified 525 Modern era properties within close proximity.

525 Nearby Examples of Modernism

Of the 525 Modern properties close to 1170 Signal Hill Road, 134 of them share a similar setting or view. All contain important characteristics of Modern residences, including the absence of ornament and detail, and the use of technologies, materials, and construction techniques of the time. They all architecturally embrace the philosophy of indoor/outdoor living and represent a unique and rarified setting.

Monterey County Criteria for Historical Resources

Circa found that the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road fails to meet any of Monterey County's criteria for historical resources for the following reasons:

- Because at least 900 homes in the Pebble Beach vicinity are examples of Modern architecture, with 525 near 1170 Signal Hill Road, the property cannot be considered representative of a distinct historical period, nor is it rare. Likewise, since so many other examples of Modernism exist in Pebble Beach, the residence cannot be said to be the “best remaining” architectural type of the Pebble Beach community.
- The residence was designed by the Los Angeles architectural firm of Richard Neutra, however there is no evidence that Neutra himself designed the residence, approved the plans, or visited the site. Neutra was collaborating with many associate architects in his office when 1170 Signal Hill Road was constructed. In addition the residence is not one of the firms exemplary or distinctive designs.
- No aspect of the property shows outstanding attention to design, detail, material, or craftsmanship. Neutra's most distinctive trademarks are completely lacking from the residence. The residence has suffered from undocumented changes, and most of the original character-defining features have been replaced (windows) or altered (enclosure of courtyard with 1992 addition).
- Signs of water infiltration including water stains, efflorescence, rust, and structural deficiencies are evident throughout the building.
- The residence was the vacation home of Arthur Connell of Los Angeles, who had no historical association to Pebble Beach or Monterey County. The residence is not the site of an important historical event, nor representative of a particular style or way of life important to the County.
- The residence neither benefits nor detracts from the historic character of Pebble Beach. It does not represent an established or familiar visual feature of the area, and is not essential to the integrity of Pebble Beach.

Conclusion

The residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road does not meet the Monterey County Criteria for Evaluation of Historic Resources, and also is not considered a historic resource at the national, state, or local level.

Massy Mehdipour
CEO
Skire, Inc.
111 Independence Drive
Menlo Park , CA 94025

May 18, 2012

Re: 1170 Signal Hill Road, Pebble Beach, CA

Background

On October 24, 2011 Circa: Historic Property Development (Circa) attended a meeting with County staff to continue discussion regarding proposed plans for the property at 1170 Signal Hill Road, Pebble Beach, CA. Circa observed that the property's ability to meet the County of Monterey (County) criteria for historical resources was omitted from the previous evaluations. As a follow up Circa provided a complete evaluation of the subject property per the County's criteria and found that the property at 1170 Signal Hill Road, Pebble Beach, CA does not meet any of the County's criteria for historical resources.

While Circa's October 14, 2011 memo addressed issues that were raised in the HRRB meeting by some board members, specifically the second phase of the Bay Area Tradition (Second Bay Area Tradition), County staff asked Circa to widened the context of the evaluation to include that which the HRRB identified as "the American International or Contemporary style" of residential architecture. Admittedly the County of Monterey does not have a definition or historic context for the American International or Contemporary style therefore, for consistency in this report, Circa uses the more inclusive term of Modern or Modernism as defined below:

MODERNISM

The following definition is from the *San Francisco Modern Architecture and Landscape Design (1935-1970) Historic Context Statement* prepared by the San Francisco City and County Planning Department, September 2010:

Modern / Modernism

There are numerous ongoing debates concerning the use of the terms Modern, modern, Modernism, and the Modern Movement. These terms have been used to describe periods of time as well as aesthetic stylistic design vocabularies. Some use the term modern to describe contemporary architecture. Others describe the Modern Movement in the United States as a period of innovative design, begun at the turn of the century, led by luminaries such as Louis Sullivan and Frank Lloyd Wright. European Modernism is often described as a 1910s-30s-era architectural movement led by Le Corbusier, J. J. P. Oud, Peter Behrens, and inclusive of the Bauhaus movement led by Walter Gropius and Ludwig Mies van der Rohe. For the purpose of this context statement, the terms Modern and Modernism will refer to a style and design vocabulary in the United States that spanned from the late 1920s through the 1960s. Key characteristics of Modern buildings include the absence of historical ornament and references, and the use of new technologies, materials and construction techniques. In this context statement, the terms Modern and

Modernism are used broadly to describe a variety of architectural styles ranging from International Style to Bay Region Modern to Brutalism.¹

Though this context statement focuses on San Francisco, it also outlines the broader contexts for the development of modernism as a whole.² The information quoted below provides a general overview of the major influences, phases, and players in national, state, and local modernism during the middle part of the 20th century.

PRECURSORS AND INFLUENCES

Modern architectural design in San Francisco [and the larger Bay Area] evolved from the stylistic and technological innovations of early American and European architects and designers. Beginning in the late 19th century, groundbreaking architects re-conceptualized the structure, form and interior spaces of buildings, and initiated a new design vocabulary that ultimately impacted the appearance of Modern buildings in San Francisco from 1935 to 1970. Along with the formative designs and writings of pioneer architects, Modern design was further influenced by international exhibitions, world fairs, critics and popular media, regional vernacular architecture, and schools of architecture. Combined, these factors cumulatively impacted the design of Modern Age buildings in San Francisco, from the sleek Streamline Moderne to post-and-beam redwood houses of the regional Bay Region Tradition.

Early American Modernism

The work and design theories of early American Modernists – in particular Louis Sullivan and Frank Lloyd Wright – influenced generations of architects across the United States and helped spawn a new design aesthetic that addressed the natural environment, contained minimal superfluous ornamentation, and emphasized function, flexibility, and an honest expression of a building’s structural frame.

Early Southern California Influence

The Greene brothers of Pasadena are ranked among the master architects of the Arts and Crafts Movement and provided inspiration to a generation of Modern architects. Charles and Henry Greene “took the simple California bungalow to the level of high art, with Pasadena’s 1907 Blacker House and 1908 Gamble House as the definitive examples of their design aesthetic.” Their sprawling shingled houses are stylistically linked to the First Bay Tradition in San Francisco, as practiced by Bernard Maybeck, Willis Polk, Joseph Worcester, and Julia Morgan, among others. The Greene Brothers influenced a generation of Southern California Modern architects, who fused Modern sensibilities with the rustic shingle style as advanced by the Greens. Numerous Modern architects were inspired by the Greens’ use of natural materials and incorporation of Japanese motifs, including Harwell Hamilton Harris, who is described as a key link between the European Modernism practiced by Richard Neutra and the romantic, regional tradition as practiced by the Greens. A prolific Los Angeles based Modern architect, Harris was an

¹ *San Francisco Modern Architecture and Landscape Design (1935-1970) Historic Context Statement* prepared by the San Francisco City and County Planning Department (September 2010), 2.

² McAlester’s *A Field Guide to American Houses* (1984) and Harris’ *American Architecture: An Illustrated Encyclopedia* (1998) are standard references for overviews of architectural styles but lack clear definitions and identification of character-defining features of Modernism/Contemporary/American International styles.

early proponent of a regional California Modernism. He worked with Neutra on the Lovell Health House, designed one of the Case Study houses, and later, designed several Modern single-family houses in the Bay Area.

Early European Modernists

European Modernism is often described as a 1910s-30s-era architectural movement led by Le Corbusier, J.J.P. Oud (of the Dutch De Stijl), Alvar Aalto, Peter Behrens, and inclusive of the Bauhaus movement led by Walter Gropius and Ludwig Mies van der Rohe. It is characterized by social goals of affordable, humane housing and by the aesthetics and functionality of the Machine Age. Pioneer Modernists utilized new technology, eschewed superfluous ornamentation, and stripped buildings down to their essential components. Many of the concepts developed by European Modernists were actualized in the United States at mid-century, particularly the ubiquitous “Miesian” office buildings, which dramatically altered the appearance of downtowns across the United States.

Bauhaus School

The hearth of European Modern architecture was arguably centered at the Bauhaus, a radical art school in Weimar, Germany founded and led by architect Walter Gropius in 1919. The Bauhaus emphasized a united approach to architecture, crafts, and fine art and in various incarnations its workshops integrated painting, sculpture, advertising, architecture, metal production, ceramics, furniture design, textiles and printmaking. Its architecture focused on “economic optimization of plan arrangements and precise calculations of light, sunlight, heat gain/loss and acoustics,” which resulted in buildings that felt lighter, airier, and were flooded with light. Many of Europe’s avant-garde writers, thinkers, artists, and architects taught at the Bauhaus – such as Paul Klee, László Moholy-Nagy, Marcel Breuer, and Wassily Kandinsky – until its closure by the Nazi regime in 1933. Many of Bauhaus’ students and faculty later emigrated to the United States, including Gropius, and the Bauhaus’ final director, architect Ludwig Mies van der Rohe.

Southern California International Style

Modern architects based in Southern California were tremendously influential in the evolution of Modern design, particularly the machine-like style later dubbed the “International Style.” European immigrants, many from Germany and Austria, held influential roles in developing and popularizing a domestic form of the sleek, functional Modern architecture.

Richard Neutra and Rudolph Schindler, Austrian émigrés whose work is focused in Southern California, particularly in Los Angeles, were both instrumental in the development of Modern residential architecture in the United States. Both were influenced by Prairie Style designs and early in their careers worked for Frank Lloyd Wright. Each also designed a Los Angeles area house for Dr. Philip Lovell; both houses are considered early International Style masterworks. Schindler’s (1925-1926) Lovell Beach House is credited as the first International Style house in the United States. Constructed of concrete, the building featured concrete piers, walls of glass, and a horizontal cantilevered upper level. Neutra’s (1927-29) Lovell Health House, set on a steeply sloped site, was a full and early expression of the International Style. This concrete and steel house featured a metallic skeleton, transparent walls, ribbon windows,

and balconies hung from the roof frame. The label “Rational Modern” has been attached to Neutra’s buildings, in contrast to Frank Lloyd Wrights “Romantic Modern.”

Regional Architecture – First Bay Tradition

Coined in 1947 by architectural critic Lewis Mumford, the Bay Region Tradition is a regional vernacular architecture endemic to the San Francisco Bay Area that is woody, informal, and anti-urban. The Bay Region Tradition evolved over nearly 100 years and has since been classified into First, Second and Third traditions, spanning from the 1880s-1970s.

The First Bay Tradition, spanning roughly from the 1880s to the early 1920s, was a radical reaction to staid Classicism of Beaux-Arts historicism. Eschewing the highly ornamented Victorian-era styles also popular at that time, First Bay Tradition architects developed a building vernacular linked to nature, site and locally sourced materials. Characteristics of the First Bay Tradition include the use of local materials, particularly redwood; an emphasis on craftsmanship and the Arts and Crafts movement; the use of unpainted wood shingle cladding; and a sensitivity to site and climate. The style emphasized volume, form, and asymmetry. Examples of the First Bay Region tradition are found in San Francisco and the greater Bay Area, particularly in the hills of the East Bay. The First Bay Tradition is closely associated with the religious and residential designs of Bernard Maybeck, Ernest Coxhead, Julia Morgan, A. Page Brown, Joseph Worcester, Louis Christian Mullgardt, A.C. Schweinfurt, John Galen Howard, and Willis Polk. Some describe it as the regional interpretation of the Eastern Shingle Style. Classically trained architect Bernard Maybeck (1862-1957), a Bay Area architect since 1890, exerted tremendous influence in the development of the regional, vernacular style.

Schooled at the Ecole des Beaux-Arts and a former apprentice of Louis Sullivan, Maybeck helped popularize the unpainted brown shingle house and what Leslie Freudenheim describes as the “handmade, medieval-referenced aspects of the Arts & Crafts simple home.” He was the first professor of architecture at the University of California at Berkeley; his students included key First Bay Tradition architects Julia Morgan, John Bakewell, and Arthur Brown, Jr.

The First Bay Tradition influenced later Modernists (i.e. architects associated with the Second Bay Tradition), who incorporated the regional vernacular of redwood, shingles, and elements of Arts and Crafts with the European Modernism popularized by the Bauhaus and the International Style. Transitional architects that bridged the first and second Bay Traditions include Henry Gutterson and John Hudson Thomas.³

Regional Architecture – Second Bay Tradition

A unique regional Modern vernacular style developed in the San Francisco Bay Area in the late-1930s. Now called the Second Bay Tradition, the emerging style fused the rustic, hand-crafted, woody-aesthetic of First Bay Tradition architects (Bernard Maybeck, Julia Morgan, Ernest Coxhead, et. al), with the sleek functional design and cubic, rectilinear forms associated with European Modernism. This union of the Arts and Crafts’ and International Style’s philosophies, materials, and volumes resulted in a simple, yet elegant regional Modern architectural style endemic to the Bay Area. The resultant

³ Ibid, 70-79.

buildings are characterized by wood cladding, large expanses of glass, overhanging eaves, and flat or low-pitched roof forms. They are generally more open and light-filled than buildings of the First Bay Tradition. Architects associated with the Second Bay Tradition designed buildings that were generally small in scale, that adapted to the landscape and climactic conditions, and that were often built of locally sourced redwood. The richness of stained redwood resulted in luminous, earthy dwellings in keeping with emerging indoor-outdoor lifestyles. The term Second Bay Tradition is used interchangeably with Bay Region Style, Second Bay Region Tradition, Bay Area Style, Bay Region Domestic, and Bay Region Modern.

The Bay Tradition styles (First, Second, and Third) are the only dominant regional styles of architecture to emerge from the San Francisco Bay Area. Earlier dominant styles, such as Italianate or Classical Revival were generally a “dry interpretation of the latest national fashion.” Unlike earlier Victorian styles, which proscribed standardized ornament such as the use of incised brackets, dentils, spandrels, and cornice treatments, buildings designed in the Second Bay Tradition style do not have a standardized look. Rather, the style is characterized by an emphasis on volume over ornamentation and common denominators such as a woodsy aesthetic, small scale, and redwood cladding (often interior as well as exterior). There is a heavy emphasis on the use of natural building materials, however traditional materials such as brick, stone, stucco and plaster are occasionally incorporated and “manipulated as both texture and structure.” Second Bay Tradition buildings are often designed with a clear sensitivity to site and the natural environment. The style is noted for the close collaboration between architects and landscape architects. Although exteriors can appear plain, or even cheaply constructed, they were often highly complex; their outward simplicity “purposely played off against highly sophisticated spatial arrangements, surfaces, and details of design, and against a learned understanding of past historic architectural history.” The Second Bay Tradition is associated with custom architects, rather than builder tracts (with the notable exception of Joseph Eichler’s architect-designed residential developments).⁴

Regional Architecture – Third Bay Tradition

In the early 1960s, the Bay Tradition continued to evolve, forming the foundation of what is now known as the Third Bay Tradition. Highly influenced by the writing of architect Charles Moore, design elements associated with the Third Bay Tradition include wood shingle cladding, plain wood siding, and shed roof forms. Third Bay Tradition buildings were described as vertical shed_roof boxes or “mine_shaft” boxes. Moore conceptualized three building forms for houses which include: rooms of various shapes arranged around a connective passage; shed_like rooms that are hung like saddlebags on to the main structure; and houses built around an aedicule – four columns supporting four beams – creating an open space frame as the house’s symbolic center.

The Third Bay Tradition coincided with a rise in mass_housing and condominium home ownership. Design elements associated with the Third Bay Tradition and The Sea Ranch complex diffused across the country and became a national condominium vernacular.³³⁶ The Sea Ranch, an iconic complex of condominiums, is sited in a bucolic, coastal area of Sonoma County and is considered a masterwork of Third Bay Tradition design. Lawrence Halprin created the landscape and development plan, which clustered buildings

⁴ Ibid, 172-173.

and provided large areas of community open space. Master architects Joseph Esherick and Charles Moore are associated with the early design phase (mid_1960s). Since 1965, versions of The Sea Ranch condominium design have dominated the design of group housing nationwide. The work of Joseph Esherick and his firm Esherick, Homsey, and Dodge spanned the bridge between the Second and Third Bay Traditions. Other architects associated with the Third Bay Tradition include Charles Moore, William Turnbull, Donylyn Lyndon, Richard Whitaker (of the firm Moore, Turnbull, Lyndon & Whitaker), Richard Peters, John Field, J.D. Buckley, and Dmitri Vedensky.⁵

MODERNISM IN PEBBLE BEACH

The context above provides a broad framework within which to begin to evaluate modernist buildings and landscapes. Similar studies of mid-century architecture and design have only recently become available, as more of these buildings reach the 50-year mark for historical evaluation. Though a number of modernist designs can be found on the Monterey Peninsula, a comprehensive study of modern architecture in this area has yet to be written. However, limited discussion of modernist designs in the area can be culled from recent studies and publications.

According to the 2010 Department of Parks and Recreation forms (DPRs) for 1170 Signal Hill Road, architect William Wurster designed the Converse House in Carmel in 1932. An early modern example, this design was “a simplified, abstracted interpretation of the Colonial Revival.”⁶ Another example, known as the Sand and Sea complex, was built in Carmel before World War II. Designed by Jon Konigshofer, the development was comprised of five houses and a garage with a studio above. It mixed modernism and regionalism in a style similar to that of Gardener Dailey and Clarence Tantau, two architects who helped shape the second phase of the Bay Area Tradition. Richard Neutra also designed the William and Alice Davey residence outside Monterey in 1939. The structure was clad in redwood and designed to integrate with the surrounding landscape.⁷

Other early examples of modern design on the Monterey Peninsula included the Honeymoon cottages in Carmel, designed by Robert Stanton in Carmel in the late 1930s. These cottages were based on earlier prototypes that used modern and prefabricated building materials. Later examples include the Walker House in Carmel, designed by Frank Lloyd Wright and constructed in 1948, and Wurster’s Merchant residence, built on Scenic Road in Carmel in 1962.⁸ Mark Mills’ noted Fan Shell house was completed at 3137 17-Mile Drive in 1972.

The 2010 DPR forms states that modernism does not appear in Pebble Beach until after World War II, with the earliest known example being the Robert Buckner residence designed by Jon Konigshofer in the late 1940s. Konigshofer also designed a house for Macdonald and Margaret Booze on Signal Hill Road several years later. The DPR further indicates that a number of other architects associated with modernism, including Gardiner Dailey, Walter Burde, Will Shaw, Henry Hill, and Charles Moore, also designed houses in Pebble Beach throughout the middle part of the 20th century.⁹ No specifics were provided as to the dates or addresses of these designs.

⁵ Ibid, 133.

⁶ Anthony Kirk, Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms for 1170 Signal Hill Road (2010), 3 of 6.

⁷ Ibid, 4 of 6.

⁸ Kent Seavey, *Carmel: A History in Architecture*, (Charleston, SC: Arcadia Publishing, 2007), 113.

⁹ Anthony Kirk, Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms for 1170 Signal Hill Road (2010), 4 of 6.

Mapping and Survey Methodology

The mapping of the entire Pebble Beach community was completed in January 2012 [overall map w/key in appendix] and then divided into north and south sections. A "windshield" survey of Pebble Beach properties constructed between 1944-1962 was conducted in February 2012. To compare like-properties the subject property was used as a center point and radiating outward over 525 properties were surveyed, identifying those that had similar setting/views. Categories of identification were:

- “3” = house has view of ocean and golf course
- “2” = house has view of ocean only
- “1” = house has view of golf course only
- “0” = none of the above or view of property obstructed

Findings of the Pebble Beach Modernism Survey

Of the 900 residences constructed between 1944-1962 in Pebble Beach over 525 properties were surveyed within close proximity to the subject property. The 525 surveyed properties fall into the following categories:

- 64** “3” = view of ocean and golf course (including 1170 Signal Hill)
- 20** “2” = view of ocean only
- 50** “1” = view of golf course only
- Remainder** “0” = none of the above or view of property obstructed

Therefore, 134 modern residences that share a similar setting are neighboring 1170 Signal Hill. They all contain important characteristics identified with modern residences including the absence of ornament and detail, and the use of technologies, materials and construction techniques of the time. They all architecturally embrace the philosophy of indoor/outdoor living and represent a particularly unique and rarified setting. These 134 residences are only a small portion of a much larger group of modern residences within the Pebble Beach community. While the DPR form identifies the subject residence (constructed in 1958) as "...an important and relatively early example of modern architecture in Pebble Beach", this is just not so.

The Monterey County Criteria for Evaluation for 1170 Signal Hill Road, Pebble Beach, CA

On January 11, 2012 County of Monterey staff requested a memo to address "American International", or "Contemporary Style" as it relates to the historic significance of the residence at 1170 Signal Hill. As stated earlier the terms Modern and Modernism will be utilized in the following evaluation.

A. Historical and Cultural Significance.

1. The resource or district proposed for designation is particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region, or way of life.

A thorough search of the Monterey County Assessor Records shows that the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road is one of 900 residences constructed in Pebble Beach and nearby area between 1959 and 1963 (i.e. on the cusp of 50 years old)¹⁰. In addition, a windshield survey was conducted of over 525 residences (out of 900 constructed in the same period) within the area neighboring the

¹⁰ Research utilized the Monterey County's Assessors Books 007 and 008 (Del Monte Forest) 009 (Carmel Unincorporated) and 241 and 243 (Carmel Highlands – HWY 1 to Palo Colorado Road).

subject property. From these endeavors no evidence was uncovered that indicates that the subject property is particularly representative of a distinct historical period, type, style, region, or way of life.

The historic resource evaluation¹¹ (DPR set October 2010) states that Pebble Beach is far behind the design and construction of modern residences in Carmel and Monterey; that "... modernism seems not to have made an appearance in Pebble Beach until some years after the war [1945]..." Continuing the discussion of modernism at the local level, the report alludes to the fact that there may be even more examples of modern architecture in Pebble Beach but "... *the lack of a comprehensive local architectural history, together with the difficulty of viewing many residences from public thoroughfares, makes a definitive assertion on this point impossible*" [emphasis added]. This statement demonstrates that the opinion given is based on lack of substantiated information. From our research and survey findings we can draw definitive assertion that the subject property does not meet this criteria.

2. The resource or district proposed for designation is, or contains, a type of building or buildings which was once common but is now rare.

Based on the facts stated in response #1 the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road was/is commonplace and not rare.

3. The resource or district proposed for designation was connected with someone renowned.

The residence was the summer/weekend residence of Arthur L. Connell of Los Angeles. Mr. Connell had no particular historic association to Pebble Beach or Monterey County.

4. The resource or district proposed for designation is connected with a business or use which was once common but is now rare.

The building was designed and used as a residence and is not considered rare.

5. The resource or district proposed for designation represents the work of a master builder, engineer, designer, artist, or architect whose talent influenced a particular architectural style or way of life.

The residence was designed by the Los Angeles (Silver Lake) architectural firm of Richard Neutra, however, there is no evidence that Neutra himself designed the residence, approved the set or even visited the site¹². What appears to be the original project plans (on file) are not signed by Neutra, or anyone from the firm, therefore the plans cannot be presumed to be approved (or not approved) by Neutra. In addition Neutra was collaborating with many associate architects in his Silver Lake office, such as John Blanton¹³, where the main focus was on small-scale residential design, therefore it is impossible to determine who actually designed the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road. The residence is not

¹¹ Kirk evaluation/DPR set October 2010.

¹² Hines, Thomas S., Richard Neutra and the Search for Modern Architecture, (New York: Rizzoli International Publications, Inc., 2009), 298.

¹³ Hines, 255-256, 275.

identified as one of the firm's exemplary or even particularly distinctive residential designs. Indeed, the residence is noted for its incompatibility with the environment (water leaks, wind gusts throughout, heating problems, etc.) and has suffered from undocumented changes and alterations to the original design including replacement of Neutra's signature ribbon windows and enclosure of the courtyard area.

6. The resource or district proposed for designation is the site of an important historic event or is associated with events that have made a meaningful contribution to the nation, state, or community.

The residence is not the site of an important historic event that made a meaningful contribution to the nation, state, or community.

7. The resource or district proposed for designation has a high potential of yielding information of archaeological interest.

The residence does not have a high potential of yielding information of archaeological interest.

B. Historic, Architectural, and Engineering Significance.

1. The resource or district proposed for designation exemplifies a particular architectural style or way of life important to the county.

As stated in criterion A1 above, the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road is one of 900 residences constructed in Pebble Beach between 1959 and 1963 and one of over 525 constructed in the immediate area. No evidence indicates that the property is of *particular* style or way of life important to the county.

The historic resource evaluation¹⁴ (DPR set October 2010) states that Pebble Beach is far behind the design and construction of modern residences in Carmel and Monterey; that "... modernism seems not to have made an appearance in Pebble Beach until some years after the war [1945]..." Continuing the discussion of modernism at the local level, the report alludes to the fact that there may be even more examples of modern architecture in Pebble Beach but "... the lack of a comprehensive local architectural history, together with the difficulty of viewing many residences from public thoroughfares, makes a definitive assertion on this point impossible." Due to these limitations Kirk could not make a definitive assertion however our research and survey findings allows us to confidently conclude that the subject property does not exemplify a particular architectural style or way of life important to the county.

2. The resource or district proposed for designation exemplifies the best remaining architectural type of a community.

The evaluation does not substantiate, explain or defend how the subject property meets the CR Criterion 3. Indeed, the Significance discussion elaborates on the subject of local modernism but does not mention the contribution of 1170 Signal Hill Road in this movement in Pebble Beach or otherwise.

¹⁴ Kirk evaluation/DPR set October 2010.

"In contrast to Carmel and Monterey, modernism seems not to have made an appearance in Pebble Beach until some years after the war, although the lack of a comprehensive local architectural history, together with the difficulty of viewing many residences from public thoroughfares, makes a definitive assertion on this point impossible. In 1940 Frank Lloyd Wright designed a spacious house for John Nesbitt on 17 Mile Drive, but it was never constructed. Near the end of the decade Jon Konigsberger created a handsome residence for the Robert Buckner family in Pebble Beach that was one of fifty-three houses featured in the exhibition 'Domestic Architecture of the San Francisco Bay Region', which opened in October 1949 at the San Francisco Museum of Art. Several years later Konigsberger built a house for Macdonald and Margaret Booze on Signal Hill Road, and throughout the mid-century other architects associated with modernism, such as Gardiner Dailey, Walter Burde, Will Shaw, Henry Hill, and Charles Moore, also designed houses in Pebble Beach."

The evaluation states the fact that as an example of modernism at the local level 1170 Signal Hill Road is far behind the design and construction of modern residences in Carmel and Monterey; that "... modernism seems not to have made an appearance in Pebble Beach until some years after the war [1945]..." However, Kirk fails to provide a comparison of the subject residence with other known modernist residences in Pebble Beach by deflecting the exercise and saying that "... the difficulty of viewing many residences from public thoroughfares, makes a definitive assertion on this point impossible." The windshield survey and photographing of 525 properties conducted by our consulting team was exclusively from the public right-of-way making a comparison of like-properties very possible,

From these statements, and others elaborated upon in this evaluation, it is clear that 1170 Signal Hill Road is not "the best remaining" architectural type of the Pebble Beach community.

3. The construction material or engineering methods used in the resource or district proposed for designation embody elements of outstanding attention to architectural or engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship.

Nothing in the evaluation of 1170 Signal Hill Road recognizes outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, material or craftsmanship. Indeed, in this later period of Neutra's career his residential buildings were accentuated with a pronounced feature resembling an appendage or "spider leg" as it was referred to. Neutra's biographer points out that this "...spiderleg outrigging projection of the roof beams...became one of the most distinctive trademarks [emphasis added] of Neutra's later work...[and] became Neutra's most ubiquitous 'ornament'."¹⁵ This important character-defining feature is completely lacking from 1170 Signal Hill.

¹⁵ Hines, 275.

Most of the original primary character-defining features have either been replaced (windows) or altered (enclosure of the courtyard with the 1992 addition). The most noteworthy remaining original element is the main entry of which its importance is greatly diminished due to its location at the north elevation. There, where it seems to have been placed as an outcast, is barely visible and inconveniently located as far from the driveway and garage as possible. As with other modern residences of this period "[w]hen a gaping garage functioned as the real entryway, the formal 'main' entrance was usually ignored. Entering the house via cluttered garage and kitchen made residents and visitors miss the architect's [Neutra's] intention to create a particular series of processional [interior] experiences."¹⁶ Even Dr. Anthony Kirk states in his own evaluation of the property that "A few of Neutra's design decisions appear infelicitous, most notably the placement of the main entrance at the north side, where it is accessible only from on-street parking rather than the property itself, suggesting it was rarely used". The entry's adversely deteriorated condition, though Neutra-esque in design is not an example of outstanding attention to architectural or engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship.

As evidenced by documented¹⁷ signs of extensive water infiltration including water stains, efflorescence, rust and structural deficiencies throughout the building the residence does not exhibit outstanding attention to engineering design, detail, material or craftsmanship.

The residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road does not retain outstanding attention to architectural design, detail, material or craftsmanship.

C. Community and Geographic Setting.

1. The proposed resource materially benefits the historic character of the community.

The residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road neither materially benefits nor detracts from the historic character of the Pebble Beach.

2. The unique location or singular physical characteristic of the resource or district proposed for designation represents an established and familiar visual feature of the community, area, or county.

The residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road does not represent an established or familiar visual feature of the community, area, or county.

3. The district is a geographically definable area, urban or rural possessing a significant concentration or continuity of site, buildings, structures, or object unified by past events, or aesthetically by plan or physical development.

The property at 1170 Signal Hill Road has not been identified as a district. The community of Pebble Beach is a world renown planned development/leisure community (district).

¹⁶ Ibid, 276.

¹⁷ Covell Construction Structural Report March 2012.



4. The preservation of a resource or resources is essential to the integrity of the district.

The preservation of the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road is not essential to the integrity of Pebble Beach.

In conclusion, the residence at 1170 Signal Hill Road does not meet the Monterey County Criteria for Evaluation of Historic Resources and therefore is not considered a historic resource at the national, state or local level.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sheila McElroy". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, sweeping initial 'S'.

Sheila McElroy
Principal
Circa: Historic Property Development

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books:

Bernard, Lance V. *Architecture and Regional Identity in the San Francisco Bay Area, 1870-1970*. Lewiston, New York: The Edwin Mellen Press, 2007.

Brown, Mary. *San Francisco Modern Architecture and Landscape Design: 1935-1970*. San Francisco: San Francisco City and County Planning Department, 2010.

Boone, Laurie and others. *Architecture of the Monterey Peninsula*. Monterey, California: Monterey Peninsula Museum of Art, 1976.

Cerny, Susan Dinkelspiel. *An Architectural Guidebook to San Francisco and the Bay Area*. Salt Lake City: Gibbs Smith, 2007.

Gebhard, David and others. *A Guide to Architecture in San Francisco & Northern California*. Santa Barbara: Peregrine Smith, Inc., 1973.

Hines, Thomas S. *Richard Neutra and the Search for Modern Architecture*. New York: Rizzoli, 2005.

Hines, Thomas S. and Arthur Drexler. *The Architecture of Richard Neutra: From International Style to California Modern*. New York: Museum of Modern Art, 1982.

Lamprecht, Barbara. *Richard- Complete Works*. Cologne: Taschen, 2010.

Seavey, Kent. *Carmel: A History in Architecture (Images of America)*. Charleston, South Carolina: Arcadia Publishing, 2007.

Trieb, Marc. *Appropriate: The Houses of Joseph Esherick*. San Francisco: William Stout Publishers, 2007.

Weinstein, Dave. *Signature Architects of the San Francisco Bay Area*. Layton, Utah: Gibbs, Smith, Publisher, 2006.

Woodbridge, Sally with Introduction by David Gebhard. *Bay Area Houses*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1976.

Websites:

Art Full Text, Wilson Web (accessed through San Francisco Public Library website)
<http://sfpl.org/index.php>

Environmental Design Archives
<http://www.ced.berkeley.edu/cedarchives/>

Internet Archive
<http://www.archive.org/>



JSTOR

<http://www.jstor.org/>

Online Archive of California

<http://www.oac.cdlib.org/>

Richard and Dion Neutra Architecture

<http://www.neutra.org/>